

**“If we could all be Peter Lougheed”
Provincial premiers and their legacies, 1967-2007¹**

J.P. Lewis
Carleton University
jlewis3@connect.carleton.ca

Paper for Presentation at The Annual Meeting of the Canadian Political Science Association
Concordia University, Montreal
June 2010

Introduction

For a variety of reasons, the careers of Canadian provincial premiers have escaped explicit academic attention. Premiers are found frequently in Canadian political science literature, but more for direct roles and actions – in questions of the constitution, federalism, public policy and electoral and legislative studies – instead of longitudinal study and analysis. This fits a pattern of neglect in the field; some academics have lamented the lack of direct attention to provincial politics and history (Brownsey and Howlett 2001). The aggregate imprints of premiers are relatively ignored outside of regional and provincial treatments. No pan-Canadian assessment of premiers exists, and probably for good reason. The theoretical and methodological concerns with asking general research questions about premiers are plenty; leadership theory and historical approaches provide some foundations but any approach is going to confront conceptual challenges. This is where this study is found – in a void of precedents but a plethora of qualitative data.²

Regardless of methodological challenges, some historians, political scientists and members of the media have not shied away from ranking and assessing national leaders. Some of the more popular treatments (from the popular culture version to the more academic approach) include Ferguson’s *Bastards and Boneheads*, Granatstein and Hillmer’s *Prime Ministers: Ranking Canada’s Leaders*, and Bliss’s *Right Honourable Men*. Bliss (xiv), the esteemed historian, is skeptical of such endeavours, “While this is Canadian history from Parliament Hill, I am not a Hegelian and I do not believe that political leaders, least of all prime ministers of Canada, are personifications of the world spirit. Individuals do not change the course of history or move mountains with a snap of their fingers. Sometimes leaders are almost powerless against the tides of history.” Still, a conversation is worth beginning and that is the purpose of this paper: to start an informed conversation on evaluating modern-day provincial premiers and attempt to adopt an initial framework for evaluation.

A handful of premiers from the last forty years are consistently identified as historically important. Major national events have helped them achieve this status.³ Still, with greater exposure of premiers due to the rise of executive federalism and public federal-provincial

¹ The organization of this paper was directly influenced by Bill Simmons. *The Book of Basketball*. New York: ESPN Books, 2009.

² Inspiration is found in Will Ferguson’s ranking of Canadian prime ministers – “Here’s how my system work: We examine something shocking, stirring or inspirational about our past; we mull it over; we scrutinize the key players; and we pass judgment” – (Ferguson 1999:4)

³ During the 1980 constitutional discussions, Peter Lougheed and Allan Blakeney became the intellectual pick of the premiers – (Simpson 1993: 83)

squabbles there is still a gap in cross-Canada assessment with most examinations falling more in the popular history category lacking academic rigor.⁴ This leads us to the methodological section of this paper. How do we academically evaluate the legacies and successes of premiers? As the following section will show, this paper is just a beginning. I will justify my methodological approach but by no means acknowledge it as ideal. At the very least this paper hopefully serves as a starting point for the development of new research questions concerning how we assess premiers and how we may be able to link these assessments with larger concerns within the Canadian political science field such as public policy, federalism, constitutionalism, electoral studies and political parties.

Methodology

Randall White (246), writing on Ontario's recent history since 1985, warned: "the most scrupulous historians are nervous about contemporary history and will not write about the most recent past at all. And they have good reasons. It is less treacherous to pick your way through an era when those made it have left the scene." With this in mind, this study carefully attempts to evaluate a period of contemporary history. Adopting the 1967 Confederation Conference of Tomorrow as a starting point and 2007 as an end point, the sample of premiers used for this study are those who were re-elected at least once. This, of course, leaves out some notable one-term premiers but re-election seems to be a suitable first hurdle to elicit consideration.

The main data collected was from a survey sent out to approximately 200 political scientists, historians and members of the media.⁵ Fifty-four individuals completed the survey. With the option to self-identify, a number of notable Canadian political scientists and historians participated.⁶ Participants were asked to rank premiers on a scale of 1 (lowest) to 5 (highest) on the following five categories: 1) Province Building, 2) Economy and Fiscal Framework, 3) Province's Role in Canada, 4) Social Policy, and 5) Overall Legacy. Participants were also asked to describe premiers as one of the following: 1) Transformational, 2) Transitional or 3) Transactional. The ranking system was based on Daniel Schwanen's July 2003 Policy Options article "Ranking Prime Ministers of the last 50 years" and the nature of each prime minister's leadership evaluated on "how they found the country and how they left it." Because of the vast number of questions and individuals considered, participants could pass on any question they did

⁴ In 2003, Thomas Axworthy created his own Premiers' Hall of Fame picking the greatest premier from each province. For his "Hall of Fame" Axworthy (2003:A25) included W.A.C. Bennett (British Columbia, 1952-1972), Peter Lougheed (Alberta, 1971-1985 "Quite simply one of the most influential politicians in the history of Canada"), Tommy Douglas (Saskatchewan, 1944-1961), Duff Roblin (Manitoba, 1958-1967), Bill Davis (Ontario, 1971-1985 "Davis made the Ontario education system the best in Canada and played a key role in the partition of the Constitution in 1981-82"), Jean Lesage (Quebec, 1960-1966), Frank McKenna (New Brunswick, 1987-1997, "McKenna mad his small province the trendsetter of the 1990s by recognizing the impact of globalization and the primacy of human resources in coping with a changing world"), Walter Jones (Prince Edward Island, 1943-1953), Angus L. Macdonald (Nova Scotia, 1933-1940, 1945-1954), Joseph Smallwood (Newfoundland, 1949-1972). Axworthy also included a "Hall of Shame" with Maurice Duplessis (Quebec, 1936-1939, 1944-1959), Mitchell Hepburn (Ontario, 1934-1942) and Bill Vander Zalm (British Columbia, 1986-1991).

⁵ Lime Survey software was used to collect data and the project was approved by the Carleton University Research Ethics Committee.

⁶ Raymond Blake, University of Regina, Patrick H. Brennan, University of Calgary, Ken Coates, University of Waterloo, William Christian, University of Guelph, David Docherty, Wilfrid Laurier University, John English, University of Waterloo, Peter Graefe, McMaster University, Henry Jacek, McMaster University, Richard Johnston, University of British Columbia, James Lightbody, University of Alberta, Peter Loewen, University of Toronto, Alex Marland, Memorial University, David McGrane, University of Saskatchewan, Desmond Morton, McGill University, Kenneth Munro, University of Alberta, Garth Stevenson, Brock University, Ian Urquhart, Toronto Star, Graham White, University of Toronto.

not feel they could answer. The implications of incomplete rankings are addressed under the “Answer Rate” column in the results data table.

Once the surveys were completed, the rankings were averaged and tabulated. While this provided a “top down” assessment of the premiers, it was important to provide another measure of legacy or success. For this aspect, the percentage of seats each premier’s parties won while leader was considered. This methodological direction could have included popular vote but due to the emphasis the First-Past-the-Post system places on seat counts, it was decided to use this number as the view from the “ground up”. Once the premiers were ranked both according to the survey and the number of seats won, these two lists were coalesced into one ranking list displayed in the extended results section.

Table 1: The Premiers

Premier	Province	Party	Start	Finish
Bill Bennett	British Columbia	Social Credit	1975	1986
Peter Lougheed	Alberta	Progressive Conservative	1971	1985
Don Getty	Alberta	Progressive Conservative	1985	1992
Ralph Klein	Alberta	Progressive Conservative	1992	2006
Allan Blakeney	Saskatchewan	New Democratic Party	1971	1982
Grant Devine	Saskatchewan	New Democratic Party	1982	1991
Roy Romanow	Saskatchewan	New Democratic Party	1991	2001
Ed Schreyer	Manitoba	New Democratic Party	1969	1977
Howard Pawley	Manitoba	New Democratic Party	1981	1988
Gary Filmon	Manitoba	Progressive Conservative	1988	1999
Gary Doer	Manitoba	New Democratic Party	1999	2009
Bill Davis	Ontario	Progressive Conservative	1971	1985
Mike Harris	Ontario	Progressive Conservative	1995	2002
Rene Levesque	Quebec	Parti Quebecois	1976	1985
Robert Bourassa	Quebec	Liberal	1970 1985	1976 1994
Lucien Bouchard	Quebec	Parti Quebecois	1996	2001
Richard Hatfield	New Brunswick	Progressive Conservative	1970	1987
Frank McKenna	New Brunswick	Liberal	1987	1997
Bernard Lord	New Brunswick	Progressive Conservative	1999	2006
Alex Campbell	Prince Edward Island	Liberal	1966	1978
Joe Ghiz	Prince Edward Island	Liberal	1986	1993
Pat Binns	Prince Edward Island	Progressive Conservative	1996	2007
Gerald Regan	Nova Scotia	Liberal	1970	1978
John Buchanan	Nova Scotia	Progressive Conservative	1978	1990
John Hamm	Nova Scotia	Progressive Conservative	1999	2006
Frank Moores	Newfoundland	Progressive Conservative	1972	1979
Brian Peckford	Newfoundland	Progressive Conservative	1979	1989
Clyde Wells	Newfoundland	Liberal	1989	1996
Brian Tobin	Newfoundland	Liberal	1996	2000

Results

Table 2: Full Survey Results

Premier	Answer Rate (n=54)	Province Building	Economy Policy	Province's Place in Canada	Social Policy	Overall Legacy	Leader Type
Bill Bennett	75%	3.25	3.21	3.40	2.26	3.00	Transitional (42%)
Peter Lougheed	91%	4.71	4.36	4.71	3.09	4.40	Transformational (94%)
Don Getty	82%	2.55	2.36	2.54	2.07	1.96	Transitional (49%)
Ralph Klein	94%	3.37	3.19	3.41	2.17	2.92	Transactional (38%)
Allan Blakeney	83%	4.37	3.98	4.27	4.24	4.31	Transformational (60%)
Grant Devine	77%	2.35	2.37	2.39	1.85	2.09	Transactional (32%)
Roy Romanow	88%	3.90	4.06	3.98	3.84	3.96	Transformational (34%)
Ed Schreyer	80%	3.66	3.49	3.48	3.83	3.67	Transformational (36%)
Howard Pawley	74%	3.12	3.05	3.22	3.50	2.86	Transitional (47%)
Gary Filmon	84%	3.13	3.21	3.15	2.71	2.96	Transitional (40%)
Gary Doer	83%	3.71	3.80	3.72	3.64	3.76	Transactional (45%)
Bill Davis	85%	4.31	4.00	4.19	3.70	4.17	Transformational (47%)
Mike Harris	93%	2.72	3.12	3.06	2.25	2.73	Transformational (87%)
Robert Bourassa	90%	4.28	3.73	4.32	3.42	3.88	Transformational (40%)
Rene Levesque	94%	4.61	3.41	4.51	4.16	4.38	Transformational (94%)
Lucien Bouchard	90%	3.59	3.14	3.82	2.98	3.20	Transitional (57%)
Richard Hatfield	81%	4.11	3.39	4.09	3.50	3.80	Transformational (43%)
Frank McKenna	87%	4.06	4.13	4.00	3.28	3.89	Transformational (57%)
Bernard Lord	81%	2.91	2.78	2.71	2.59	2.58	Transitional (51%)
Alex Campbell	43%	3.33	3.04	2.96	2.96	3.21	Transitional (21%)
Joe Ghiz	64%	3.92	3.65	4.00	3.39	3.73	Transformational (30%)
Pat Binns	48%	2.89	2.76	2.74	2.61	2.59	Transitional (30%)
Gerald Regan	63%	3.06	2.80	2.91	2.59	2.65	Transitional/Transactional (32%)
John Buchanan	63%	2.79	2.59	2.94	2.47	2.47	Transactional (40%)
John Hamm	56%	2.77	3.03	2.55	2.55	2.63	Transitional (32%)
Frank Moores	67%	3.19	2.94	3.08	2.49	2.78	Transactional (40%)
Brian Peckford	77%	3.72	3.45	4.09	2.97	3.40	Transformational (38%)
Clyde Wells	81%	3.73	3.52	4.17	3.15	3.45	Transformational (34%)
Brian Tobin	79%	3.34	3.20	3.63	2.93	3.00	Transactional (43%)

*Leader type is the most frequent answer chosen with the leading percent (Transitional, Transformational, and Transactional)

Table 3: Aggregate Overall Rankings⁷

- 1) Peter Lougheed 4.40
- 2) Rene Levesque 4.38
- 3) Allan Blakeney 4.31
- 4) Bill Davis 4.17
- 5) Roy Romanow 3.96

- 6) Frank McKenna 3.89
- 7) Robert Bourassa 3.88
- 8) Richard Hatfield 3.80
- 9) Gary Doer 3.76
- 10) Joe Ghiz 3.73

- 11) Ed Schreyer 3.67
- 12) Clyde Wells 3.45
- 13) Brian Peckford 3.40
- 14) Alex Campbell 3.21
- 15) Lucien Bouchard 3.20

- 16) Bill Bennett 3.00
- 16) Brian Tobin 3.00
- 18) Gary Filmon 2.96
- 19) Ralph Klein 2.92
- 20) Howard Pawley 2.86

- 21) Frank Moores 2.78
- 22) Mike Harris 2.73
- 23) Gerald Regan 2.69
- 24) John Hamm 2.63
- 25) Pat Binns 2.59

- 26) Bernard Lord 2.58
- 27) John Buchanan 2.47
- 28) Grant Devine 2.09
- 29) Don Getty 1.96

⁷ Which is significant considering that Getty followed Lougheed as a Progressive Conservative Premier of Alberta

Table 4 presents the top and bottom five of each category including answer rate and excluding the overall rate.

Table 4: Other Survey Rankings

Answer Rate	Province Building	Economy Building	Province's Place in Canada	Social Policy
Top Five 1) Klein 94% 2) Levesque 94% 3) Bourassa 93% 4) Harris 93% 5) Lougheed 91%	Top Five 1) Lougheed 4.71 2) Levesque 4.61 3) Blakeney 4.37 4) Davis 4.31 5) Bourassa 4.28	Top Five 1) Lougheed 4.36 2) McKenna 4.13 3) Romanow 4.06 4) Davis 4.00 5) Blakeney 3.98	Top Five 1) Lougheed 4.71 2) Levesque 4.51 3) Bourassa 4.32 4) Blakeney 4.27 5) Davis 4.19	Top Five 1) Blakeney 4.24 2) Levesque 4.16 3) Romanow 3.84 4) Schreyer 3.83 5) Davis 3.70
Bottom Five 1) Campbell 43% 2) Binns 48% 3) Hamm 56% 4) Buchanan 63% 5) Regan 63%	Bottom Five 1) Devine 2.35 2) Getty 2.55 3) Harris 2.72 4) Hamm 2.77 5) Buchanan 2.79	Bottom Five 1) Getty 2.36 2) Devine 2.37 3) Buchanan 2.59 4) Binns 2.76 5) Lord 2.78	Bottom Five 1) Devine 2.39 2) Getty 2.54 3) Lord 2.71 4) Regan 2.91 5) Buchanan 2.94	Bottom Five 1) Devine 1.85 2) Getty 2.07 3) Harris 2.25 4) Buchanan 2.47 5) Moores 2.48

The other measure of a premier's success taken for this analysis was the percentage of seats parties they lead won in elections. Similar to the survey rankings, they range is exceptionally large from 36% (Levesque) to 87% (McKenna).

Table 5: Percentage of Seats Won

- 1) Frank McKenna 87%
- 2) Ralph Klein 75%
- 3) Peter Lougheed 73%
- 3) Don Getty 73%
- 5) Brian Peckford 72%
- 5) Brian Tobin 72%

- 7) Roy Romanow 70%
- 8) Robert Bourassa 68%
- 8) Alex Campbell 68%
- 10) Pat Binns 66%
- 11) Joe Ghiz 64%

- 12) Clyde Wells 63%
- 13) Frank Moores 62%
- 14) Lucien Bouchard 61%
- 15) Bill Bennett 60%
- 16) John Buchanan 59%
- 16) Bernard Lord 59%

- 18) Howard Pawley 56%
- 19) Ed Schreyer 54%
- 20) Grant Devine 53%
- 21) Allan Blakeney 52%
- 21) Bill Davis 52%

- 23) Gary Filmon 48%
- 24) Gary Doer 46%
- 24) Richard Hatfield 46%
- 26) John Hamm 45%
- 27) Mike Harris 43%
- 28) Gerald Regan 41%
- 29) Rene Levesque 36%

The remainder of the results section presents a closer look at each of the premiers in the order of their aggregate ranking based on combining the overall survey ranking and percentage of seats won. Each premier section acts as brief qualitative support of the empirical evidence.

29) Gerald Regan

Province: Nova Scotia	Party: Liberal	Era: 1970-1978
Survey overall legacy average: 2.69		Percentage seats won: 41%
Notable placement: 25 th Answer Rate, 26 th Province's Place in Canada		
Election record: 1-1-1	Leader Type: Transitional/Transactional 32%	

Gerald Regan was elected as a Liberal member of parliament in 1965 and would later return to federal politics in 1980 to be a cabinet minister under Pierre Trudeau (Cox 1998). However, he is better known for his time in provincial politics as the premier who followed Nova Scotia's legendary Robert Stanfield. Regan's government attempted a number of unfulfilled major projects including plans to harness the Bay of Fundy tides – Agar Adamson noted that Regan's government started off strong but drifted into complacency in its second term (Hamilton 1998). Twenty years after leaving office, Regan's legacy was greatly affected by shocking criminal charges. In 1998, Regan was found not guilty of charges including rape, attempted rape, indecent assault and unlawful confinement based on accusations from from the 1950s and 1960s (Toughill 1998). Dozens of women accused Regan of a variety of sexual assaults. At the time of the ruling, papers published allegations of 35 different women who described various actions by Regan. The trial was one of the most sensational in Maritime history.⁸

28) John Hamm

Province: Nova Scotia	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1999-2006
Survey overall legacy average: 2.63		Percentage seats won: 45%
Notable placement: 27 th Answer Rate, 26 th Province Building		
Election record: 1-1-1	Leader Type: Transitional 32%	

A former medical doctor, following the “Bill Davis-Bland” model, Hamm was described as “dull as dishwater” (Brewster 2006a).⁹ The former premier's legacy includes surviving twenty-nine months of minority government by his own “popularity and affability” (CBC News 2005). Hamm left office at the height of his popularity, but also surrounded by charges of scandal. After leaving the premier's office, Hamm had to defend his actions concerning cabinet approval of a \$350,000 government loan to a family friend (Lewandowski 2006). Still, he was highly regarded by politicians around the country including Prime Minister Stephen Harper who sought his advice on governing in a minority setting.

⁸ Regan's second set of sex-related charges was dropped in 2002 (*K-W Record* 2002a).

⁹ One his less “dull” moments was saving a woman's life at a 2005 party fundraiser, performing chest compressions while a nurse provided mouth-to-mouth (*Canadian Press* 2005a).

27) Mike Harris

Province: Ontario	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1995-2002
Survey overall legacy average: 2.73	Percentage seats won: 43%	
Notable placement: 4 th Answer Rate, 27 th Province Building, 27 th Social Policy		
Election record: 2-0-1	Leader Type: Transformational 87%	

Current Ontario premier Dalton McGuinty noted at Harris' official portrait unveiling, "The Harris years transformed politics in our province" (Leslie 2007). Few Ontario voters had no opinion of Mike Harris.¹⁰ There were many who believed Harris moved too quickly in drastically changing the face of government in Ontario – he closed or merged more than 40 hospitals, reformed education funding, amalgamated municipalities and cut 26,000 civil service positions (Mallan 2002).¹¹ As a Progressive Conservative premier interrupting ten years of Liberal and New Democratic governments, Harris was often compared to Bill Davis.¹² In contrast to Davis, Harris' legacy was a series of cuts to public service and attempts to dramatically change the governing culture.¹³ One of the most controversial episodes in Harris' time as premier was the fatal OPP shooting of unarmed aboriginal protester Dudley George. After leaving the premier's office, Harris showed some interest in leading a united right federal party before deciding against the idea in 2003. Harris' legacy was believed to hurt his successor, Ernie Eves' popularity. Henry Jacek argued, "Harris set in motion a number of policies that have caused a lot of problems for the Eves government" (*K-W Record* 2002:B12).

¹⁰ Dan Nolan (2002:A01) noted, "While Harris's legacy for the party is two back-to-back majorities, his legacy for Ontario is a mixed bag. Balanced budgets and tax cuts are now the norm -- even Liberal Leader Dalton McGuinty talks about them -- but the Harris government forever will be linked to the tragedy in Walkerton in which seven people died after drinking contaminated water in May 2000. The Harris government, in its rush to privatize and download public services, was partly blamed for the tragedy because it didn't take the time to put safeguards in place to ensure drinking water was safe." James McCarten (2002) noted, "(Harris) Certainly not as a touchy-feely consensus builder. Far from it"

¹¹ In retirement, Harris wished he would have made the changes quicker, "I wish we had cut taxes faster. I wish we had balanced the budget sooner. I wish we had increased education standards higher, changed labour law more rapidly, lowered workers' compensation premiums even more dramatically while improving workplace safety standards" (Mallan 2002:NE06).

¹² "Mike Harris was no Bill Davis, and the Tory platform was like no Conservative blueprint Ontario had ever seen before" – (Jeffrey 1999:187)

¹³ "Mike Harris has made himself a figure of contention – 'Mike the knife'" – (White 1998:300)

26) Grant Devine

Province: Saskatchewan	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1982-1991
Survey overall legacy average: 2.09	Percentage seats won: 53%	
Notable placement: 29 th Province Building, 28 th Economy Building, 29 th Province's Place in Canada		
Election record: 2-0-1	Leader Type: Transactional 32%	

The Devine government left a legacy of debt and corruption that the Saskatchewan Progressive Conservative party never recovered from.¹⁴ Devine's last few years in government were fraught with problems, including an \$842-million deficit in 1991 (Nemeth 1995). Financial challenges plagued Devine's government; he was the first premier to run a deficit in Saskatchewan in 38 years (Schreiner 1991). One of Devine's most unpopular decisions was the harmonization of the 7% provincial sales tax with the federal goods and services tax (Schreiner 1991). In the 1991 provincial election, the Progressive Conservatives were reduced to ten seats of the sixty-six-seat Saskatchewan legislature.¹⁵ A few years later, twelve members of Devine's government were charged in relation to a fraudulent schemes involving public money.¹⁶ Devine accepted responsibility even though he was never linked to the activities, "There's no way to defend yourself... the whole process has turned into a free-for-all and you're guilty by innuendo" (Bergman 1996:16). Devine attempted a comeback in 2004 to run for the federal Conservative party but did not make it past candidate nominations (*Maclean's* 2004). David Roberts (1992:A8) wrote, "in terms of political style, Mr. Devine was the epitome of the prairie populist. Sometimes he was just a farmer 'who happened to get a PhD degree.' But on the hustings, he took to dropping the g's and could parley with the best of 'em."

25) John Buchanan

Province: Nova Scotia	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1978-1990
Survey overall legacy average: 2.47	Percentage seats won: 59%	
Notable placement: 26 th Answer Rate, 25 th Province Building, 27 th Economy Building, 25 th Province's Place in Canada, 26 th Social Policy		
Election record: 4-0-1	Leader Type: Transactional 40%	

John Buchanan earned the reputation as "Teflon John", avoiding the taint of a number of patronage scandals.¹⁷ However, along with a growing deficit, the scandals began to wear down his cover. The image of the premier was that of the "people's premier" – friendly and outgoing.

¹⁴ In November 1997, the Saskatchewan Progressive Conservative suspended operations. Former party leader Bill Boyd said, "there was just no point continuing...with the trials dragging on, we were facing a hopeless situation" (Eisler, 1997:14).

¹⁵ "By 1991, Grant Devine and the Conservative Party had lost whatever popularity they had through a combination of political scandals, personal foibles, arrogance, bad management, and guilt by association with Brian Mulroney's Tories" – (Rasmussen 2001:252)

¹⁶ Members charged including the former Party Whip, Michael Hopfner and Deputy Premier and future Senator Eric Bernston. The actions under question included the pooling of communications allowances and the creation of fictitious companies. Boxes of \$1,000 bills were found linked to someone from the Conservative legislative caucus office The path of destruction left former cabinet ministers convicted and one, Jack Wolfe, taking his own life – (Bergman 1996:16)

¹⁷ "A charming, folksy political personality who exuded optimism and excelled at the art of glad-handing and political campaigning" – (Bickerton 2001:55)

Controversies near the end of his time as premier included toilet seat cover contracts to friends, kickbacks and interference with government spending (Fraser 1990).¹⁸ Buchanan was eventually cleared of all charges which dogged him but would tarnish his own legacy with another action.¹⁹ Buchanan left the premier's office when Prime Minister Mulroney appointed him to the federal senate - his successor was sworn in during a secret ceremony (Cox 1990). Buchanan was one of Mulroney's special appointments to help pass the controversial Goods and Services Tax through the senate. Years later, Buchanan was still known nationally as one of Mulroney's GST senators and provincially as the premier that left Nova Scotia with a large provincial debt.²⁰

24) Bernard Lord

Province: Nova Scotia	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1999-2006
Survey overall legacy average: 2.58	Percentage seats won: 59%	
Notable placement: 25 th Economy Building		
Election record: 2-0-1	Leader Type: Transitional 51%	

In the late-1990s, Bernard Lord was considered the “boy wonder of Canadian Conservative politics” (Morris 2006a:A6). Lord was highly regarded outside of the province for balancing the budget, cutting taxes and reducing New Brunswick's provincial debt (Morris 2006c). Recruited to lead the new united right, Lord did not seem just destined to head the Government of New Brunswick but eventually the Government of Canada. Young, attractive and bilingual, he was a dream candidate for the new Conservative party. Unfortunately for Lord's career trajectory, the growing unpopularity of increasing car insurance costs led to a greatly diminished second majority government which eventually led to a difficult legislative period and defeat in 2006. Critics of Lord described him as too indecisive and almost catatonic (Morris 2006). Destined to land on his feet, after his crushing election loss, Lord was appointed by Prime Minister Stephen Harper to review government language policies (Morris 2007).

23) Gary Filmon

Province: Manitoba	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1988-1999
Survey overall legacy average: 2.96	Percentage seats won: 48%	
Notable placement: None		
Election record: 3-0-2	Leader Type: Transitional 40%	

At the time of his defeat, Filmon was the longest-serving premier and a popular figure amongst his peers (Nairne 1999).²¹ Filmon had positive legacy of balancing the province's books and helping to cut the unemployment rate (The Globe and Mail 1999b). Nelson Wiseman

¹⁸ Buchanan left office under investigation by the RCMP into allegations concerning patronage - Cox 1990a

¹⁹ In 1991, Buchanan was cleared in the case involving the awarding of contracts to government insiders and individuals with connections to the government - Spears 1991; In 1992, Buchanan was cleared by the RCMP of accusations related to a secret trust fund of \$216,300 from 15 sources created to help him pay off personal debts - (Toronto Star 1992)

²⁰ In 1978 when he became premier the province had a debt of \$500 million and when he left in 1990 it was \$5 billion. - (Canadian Press 2006a)

²¹ Filmon and Doer were boyhood friends - at Filmon's portrait unveiling, Doer stated, “I believe Gary Filmon has made Manitoba a better place to live” - (Rabson 2005); Roy Romanow stated, “He (Filmon) had a pan-Canadian view as a provincial premier and worked hard for Canadian unity” - (Killick 2000)

described Filmon’s regime as “cautious and conservative”.²² Heading into his 1999 election defeat, Filmon was tied with Gary Doer’s New Democratic Party at 42 percent but still suffering from the 1995 vote-rigging scandal and concerns over the government keeping its commitments (Girard 1999a).²³ Similar to many other ex-premiers, Filmon was recruited to lead a federal party, in his case, the new formation of the Reform Party - the Canadian Alliance (Killick 2000). In 2005, Prime Minister Paul Martin appointed Filmon chairman of the Security Intelligence Review Committee that oversees the Canadian Security Intelligence Service (Samyn 2005).

22) Howard Pawley

Province: Manitoba	Party: New Democratic Party	Era: 1981-1988
Survey overall legacy average: 2.86	Percentage seats won: 56%	
Notable placement: None		
Election record: 2-0-1	Leader Type: Transitional 47%	

Ending his tenure as premier abruptly in 1988, reporters gasped when he broke the news.²⁴ With a glance at the polls the departure should not have been such a surprise - only a month before the announcement, his New Democratic government was running 25 points behind the Progressive Conservative party (*Montreal Gazette* 1988). While he was premier, Pawley was a low-key orator and leader. The political battles he faced in the province included debates over the rights of French-language residents in the mid-1980s (*The Globe and Mail* 1988a). Near the end of his time as premier, Pawley was challenged by backbencher dissent and the unpopular decision to increase auto insurance premiums by 24 percent (York 1988a).²⁵ Pawley left office when his government fell on a budget vote in 1988. Years after Pawley left office he was associated with the old socialist-style NDP in Manitoba as Gary Doer running under the slogan “Today’s NDP” comforted voters by stating, “I’m not Howard Pawley” (Girard 1999).

21) Pat Binns

Province: Prince Edward Island	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1996-2007
Survey overall legacy average: 2.59	Percentage seats won: 66%	
Notable placement: 28 th Answer Rate, 26 th Economy Building		
Election record: 3-0-1	Leader Type: Transitional 30%	

Prior to his foray in provincial politics, Binns was a federal Conservative member of parliament from 1984 to 1988. Binns and his Conservatives were competing for their fourth consecutive election victory when they were reduced to four of twenty-seven seats.²⁶ Binns campaigned for Harper in the 2006 federal election and in 2007 received an appointment as

²² “As the Filmon government approached the 1999 election, a decade of protracted restraint had left a residue of profound and simmering social tensions” – (Netherton 2001:229)

²³ While Filmon said he knew nothing about it, a handful of senior Conservatives including his chief of staff resigned – (Girard 1999a)

²⁴ The *Ottawa Citizen* (1988) observed, “despite the perfunctory denials, it looks as if Manitoba Premier Howard Pawley is not just resigning but fleeing a sinking ship”.

²⁵ NDP MLA James Walding brought down the government with his vote against the budget – York 1988b; During the outcry over the premium hike, the Manitoba Progressive Conservative Party attracted 10,000 new members in 10 days – (*The Globe and Mail* 1988a)

²⁶ Binns campaigned on a promise to continue his legacy of job creation and steady economic growth – (Morris 2007)

Canada's ambassador to Ireland (Globe and Mail 2007a). Some of the issues that led to Binns' lose in 2007 included broken promises to build a new school which was not included in the budget, the delay of a report on MLAs' pay and environmental policy (The Guardian 2007a).

20) Frank Moores

Province: Newfoundland	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1972-1979
Survey overall legacy average: 2.78		Percentage seats won: 62%
Notable placement: 25 th Social Policy		
Election record: 3-0-1	Leader Type: Transactional 40%	

Moores was elected as federal Member of Parliament in 1968 but left Ottawa to become leader of the Newfoundland Tories in 1971 (Moore 2005). Later in his years as premier, Moores stood up to seal hunt protesters in Washington, Paris and London (Richer 2005). A popular figure, in the months leading up to Moores' departure, the premier was still running 14.5 percent ahead of Liberal leader Bill Rowe (Walsh 1979). Moores' dexterity in communication skills was noted by John Sawatsky (1987:304): "He had been born with a silver spoon in his mouth, yet identified instinctively with ordinary people; he could move from an outpost kitchen to a union hall to a multinational boardroom in New York without missing a beat." Moores' post-premier career was defined by his relationship with Prime Minister Brian Mulroney where he found both success and controversy.²⁷

19) Gary Doer

Province: Manitoba	Party: New Democratic Party	Era: 1999-2009
Survey overall legacy average: 3.76		Percentage seats won: 46%
Notable placement: None		
Election record: 3-0-3	Leader Type: Transactional 45%	

Much of the NDP's recent success in Manitoba is seen to rest with the popularity of Doer; campaigns were normally centred on the notion of "Gary Doer and Today's NDP". With both a tremendous run as leader and premier, Doer was the Manitoba New Democratic Party leader for twenty-one years and premier for ten. He did not avoid trouble entirely; Failed pledges to end "hallway medicine", the problematic Crocus Investment Fund, improper photo-radar fine management and election-expense claim snafus in 1999 all caused Doer political headaches (Lett 2009). Still Doer was well respected nationally, advising federal NDP leader Jack Layton on negotiations concerning the 2005 federal budget with the minority Liberal government (Taber 2009). In August 2009, Prime Minister Harper appointed Doer as the new ambassador to the United States (Blanchfield et al. 2009). Dan Lett (2009) wrote, "in the final analysis, it is perhaps not the individual accomplishments or incidents that define the Doer years...it is the roles that he played to perfection: 1) The Strategist, 2) The Firefighter, and 3) The Movie Star."

²⁷ Moores' connection to Mulroney later linked him to the Airbus affair which the RCMP eventually apologized for as Moores noted, "I'm like a lightning rod. All this damn stuff that's happening all of a sudden ends up with me" – (Singer 2005); Moores was a leading backroom organizer for Mulroney's 1983 leadership campaign and later the head of a powerful lobby group –(Richer 2005); In 1995, Moores was implicated with Brian Mulroney in the Karlheinz Schreiber airbus affair which was later dropped; Moores received an apology from the federal government – (Moore 2005)

18) (tie) Don Getty

Province: Alberta Party: Progressive Conservative Era: 1985-1992
Survey overall legacy average: Percentage seats won:
Notable placement: 28th Province Building, 29th Economy Building, 28th Province's Place in
Canada, 28th Social Policy
Election record: 2-0-0 Leader Type: Transitional 49%

As Alberta's new premier in 1985, Don Getty had giant shoes to fill by following Peter Lougheed. While Getty shared Lougheed's professional football background, he did not duplicate his success.²⁸ During his premiership, Getty led a fractious cabinet and a government that experienced some of the most difficult years in Alberta history – Getty became the “repository blame” for many of the province's struggles during this time (Lisac 2004). Getty developed a reputation of being detached from day-to-day business with a tendency to spend too much time on the golf course (Jeffery 1999; Brownsey 2001). A sad illustration of his weak legacy took place during a 1999 Alberta Progressive Conservative convention when his appearance on a retrospective video quieted down a boisterous crowd (Lisac 2004). With constant comparisons to his predecessor, Getty suffered from unpopularity and being misunderstood (Cernetig 1992b).²⁹ Allan Tupper argued, “In a sense, Mr. Lougheed has haunted Mr. Getty. Unlike the other premiers of the last 20 years – Bill Davis, Rene Levesque, Brian Peckford – Mr. Lougheed is someone who has maintained this tremendous public presence” (Cernetig 1992c:A1).³⁰ Near the end of his seven-year reign, Getty received a fair amount of criticism over his handling of the economy. The province had gone from debt free in 1985 to \$14 billion in debt in 1992-1993 (Schuettler 1992). His own party also started to turn on him in the end. Former minister Dave King wrote an editorial in the *Edmonton Journal* in 1991 urging him to leave (Oake 1992).³¹ Mark Lisac (1992b:A7) remembered Getty – “His seven years in office were a wild ride through rough circumstances, occasional success, family difficulties, a ballooning government debt, a dangerous ulcer operation, gaffes like the wife-beating joke he told for no particular reason at the start of the 1989 election campaign, stunning displays of coolness and skill at Conservative conventions where his leadership seemed perennially in danger.”

18) (tie) Richard Hatfield

Province: New Brunswick Party: Progressive Conservative Era: 1970-1987
Survey overall legacy average: 3.80 Percentage seats won: 46%
Notable placement: None
Election record: 4-0-1 Leader Type: Transformational 43%

Biographers Cormier and Michaud (1991:xi) note, “understanding the complex and paradoxical Hatfield was fascinating but difficult...we had to weigh the rumours and myths put

²⁸ Don Braid (1985, B14) noted, “Getty, Lougheed's replacement, won't have Lougheed's clout for years, if ever”.

²⁹ In his seventh-year as premier only one in five Albertans approved of him – (Cernetig 1992a)

³⁰ Tupper continued by saying, “Mr. Lougheed is the person who is still seen by many people – in and out of the province – as the real leader of the Progressive Conservative Party. Mr. Lougheed is clearly still the major political figure in the province, even though he doesn't hold elected office” – (Cernetig 1992c:A1)

³¹ A senior party fundraiser said at the time, “He's a nice fellow but he's not up to the job. Ninety-nine percent of the party wants him to leave” – (Oake 1992:A26)

forward by his detractors against the unconditional defence offered by the supporters”.³² A man who few got to know very well, he is remembered for electoral and political reforms and maintenance of social programs introduced by his predecessor Louis Robichaud (Cormier and Michaud 1991). His dedication to language policy made New Brunswick the only province in Canada with official bilingualism. While Hatfield’s seventeen-year run was incredibly impressive, his political end was very decisive with his party shut out of seats in the 1987 election. Hugh Mellon (2001:92) notes, “his apparent inability to grasp the implications of the growing polarization of the 1980s was one of his most critical failings.” Hatfield led a colourful life outside of government; he loved to party late into the night and rumours swirled around his sexual orientation (*K-W Record* 1991).³³ Long-time journalist Mike Duffy noted Richard Hatfield had a unique ability to create news – both legitimate and off-colour (Sawler 2009). One of his biggest miscues in office was the Bricklin car boondoggle that cost taxpayers \$20 million (*K-W Record* 1991). In 1984, RCMP officers arrested him on marijuana possession charges – Hatfield was found non-guilty when his lawyer successfully argued that the drugs had been planted on him (Story 1987a).³⁴ Hatfield was appointed to the senate by Prime Minister Mulroney in 1990. John Lownsbrough (1993:C18) wrote, “Richard Hatfield emerges as an intriguing amalgam of populist and elitist strains. A beguiling figure in many ways and a rather sad one, too.” Jonathan Ferguson (1991:A6) argued, “His (Hatfield) widespread popularity in the province’s French-speaking Acadian population – even though he did not speak French well – frustrated his political opponents as Hatfield won away the Acadians’ traditional support from the provincial Liberals. He became a champion of Acadian and native peoples’ rights in constitutional talks.”

16) (tie) Bill Bennett

Province: British Columbia	Party: Social Credit	Era: 1975-1986
Survey overall legacy average: 3.00	Percentage seats won: 60%	
Notable placement: None		
Election record: 3-0-0	Leader Type: Transitional 42%	

Bill Bennett, son of the legendary British Columbia premier W.A.C. Bennett emerged late in his premiership from out of his father’s shadow as a “tough guy controlling a powerful new machine” (Garr 1985: 1). The tough guy image was notably linked to his policies during his second term. One of Bennett’s most lasting actions was the social and economic change introduced by his Social Credit government in 1983. Bennett surprised British Columbians with his sudden resignation citing his father’s long reign as premier – “I made the decision because I was convinced that there must be political renewal...having had the experience of my father, having stayed as premier and leader too long, the party eventually ends up with defeat” (Smith

³² “Although Hatfield would never have been described as a rabble-rouser, especially when seen shopping leisurely on Saturday mornings at the Fredricton farmers’ market, he did in his own quiet way prove to be a progressive reformer” – (Hyson 2005:85)

³³ With the nickname “Disco Dick”, Hatfield love to travel to New York City, London and Morocco. Alan Story (1987b:A28) asked “How many Canadian premiers keep a sizable collection of dolls in their homes? How many premiers would claim that, on election night, they didn’t watch the results? How many New Brunswick premiers have spent 5 ½ months out of the province, as Hatfield did in 1979? How many have been tried and acquitted on a marijuana possession charge?”

³⁴ Allegations also surrounded an incident in 1981 when Hatfield invited back two male university students to his home and offered them marijuana and cocaine – (Story 1987a)

and Harper 1986:A1). Bennett’s legacy included bringing Expo 86 to British Columbia (Ward 2006). His “tough guy image” was created by his 1983 provincial budget that almost provoked a general strike and found reaction across the country (Smith 1986). During his premiership he battled continuous scandal, with a number of minister resignations including one caught in a prostitution ring and another beaten by a lover’s husband (Smith 1986). After leaving office, Bennett confronted legal troubles in the mid-1990s concerning insider trading.³⁵

16) (tie) Rene Levesque

Province: Quebec	Party: Parti Quebecois	Era: 1976-1985
Survey overall legacy average: 4.38	Percentage seats won: 36%	
Notable placement: 2 nd Answer Rate, 2 nd Province Building, 2 nd Province’s Place in Canada, 2 nd Social Policy		
Election record: 2-0-2	Leader Type: Transformational 94%	

More than any other premier in the last forty years, Rene Levesque was a political giant both provincially and nationally. Biographer Peter Desbarats (1977:xvi) wrote, “If there is a single French-Canadian public figure whose life illuminates an entire generation...it is Rene Levesque.” He was a complex historical figure, his mix of social progressiveness and strident Quebec nationalism making him both a hero and villain to his non-supporters.³⁶ He reformed political fund-raising, introduced anti-scab legislation, improved laws on workplace health and safety and brought in provincial auto insurance. When Rene Levesque passed away in 1987, Ontario premier at the time, David Peterson called him “one of the titans in the recent history of our country” (*The Globe and Mail* 1987). Similar to other leader-centric parties, for years, the Parti Quebecois was simply viewed as the party of Rene Levesque.³⁷

14) Ed Schreyer

Province: Manitoba	Party: New Democratic Party	Era: 1969-1977
Survey overall legacy average: 3.67	Percentage seats won: 54%	
Notable placement: None		
Election record: 2-1-0	Leader Type: Transformational 36%	

When Ed Schreyer became the youngest premier in Manitoba history at 33, he had already been a member of parliament for two terms and a member of the legislative assembly at 22 (Fotheringham 1989). Jeffrey Simpson (1978:P9) wrote, “Moderation on language policy, moderation on social questions. These were the hallmarks of Mr. Schreyer’s career as Premier.” Three major accomplishments of Schreyer were identified as: 1) the preservation of Medicare, 2) the implementation of public auto insurance and 3) the hydroelectricity projects in Northern Manitoba (*Winnipeg Free Press* 2005a). By the late 1970s, some of Schreyer’s economic

³⁵ In 1996, Bennett was found guilty of insider trading and the British Columbia Securities Commission banned him from trading for ten years – (Gibson and Lush 1996)

³⁶ “For millions of Quebecers, he was a cultural symbol as much as a partisan figure: a little guy, whose weaknesses and strengths were a reflection of all the contradictions in French-speaking Quebec. He was full of paradoxes...The man who invented the term sovereignty-association hated labels and definitions” – (Fraser 2001:xxxi)

³⁷ On Levesque bowing out as leader, Jean Chretien noted, “The PQ is the party of Levesque. Could we have said in 1960 that the Union Nationale would be dead after Duplessis? We will be able to judge after his departure” – (Graham 1985a:P1)

approaches based on the Keynesian paradigm became problematic (Netherton 2001). At the age of 43, Schreyer was appointed governor-general by Pierre Trudeau where he left his own unique legacy of gaffes and informality at Rideau Hall.³⁸ After being premier and governor-general, Schreyer was still a relatively young man with more political drive left. In 1989, Schreyer was urged to run for leadership of the New Democratic Party (York 1989a).³⁹ Later, in 2006, Schreyer unsuccessfully ran for the New Democrats in the federal election (Samyn, 2005a: A1).

13) Lucien Bouchard

Province: Quebec	Party: Parti Quebecois	Era: 1996-2001
Survey overall legacy average: 3.20	Percentage seats won: 61%	
Notable placement: None		
Election record: 1-0-0	Leader Type: Transitional 57%	

Similar to other Quebec leaders before him, Bouchard was a difficult study.⁴⁰ He rose quickly from an unknown federal cabinet minister to a national political force (Mason Lee 1989). Many believed his emotions and work ethic were his dominant personal traits.⁴¹ A popular view image of Bouchard is as an economic success but a political failure (Macafee 2001). Bouchard spent a majority of his time on fixing not the constitutional situation of Quebec but rather the financial mess – driven to eliminate the province’s major deficit, Bouchard severely cut education and health funding (Panetta 2001). Bouchard’s departure from the premier’s office was linked to his failure to achieve Quebec independence: “I accept my share of the blame for failing to rekindle the flame and to impress upon our fellow citizens the gravity of the situation” (Panetta 2001). On his resignation, one of Bouchard’s closest political advisors noted, “He has gone. Gone because he could not reach the main objective that had brought him there: to make Quebec a country” (Lisee 2001). Some suggest that it was hard-line sovereignists who soured Bouchard’s taste for the fight (Wattie 2001). Still, a poll in 2006 showed he would be the most popular party leader in Quebec if he made a return to politics (Gordon 2006).

³⁸ At two press gallery dinners, guests – mostly reporters and politicians – booed and threw buns at Governor-General Schreyer – (Walkom 1983)

³⁹ This push happened even though Schreyer encountered major criticism in 1987 for describing homosexuality as “an affliction” and an “abnormal tendency” – (McGregor 2005)

⁴⁰ “He was talented as he was complex” – (Burney 2005:163)

⁴¹ On Bouchard, Brian Mulrone once noted, “This is not a widely read man. This is a hard-working guy and a disciplined guy, but not a widely read man at all” – (Newman 2005:177); Some colleagues described him as impatient and “too emotional for politics” – (Martin 1997:219); Jeffrey Simpson (1993:290) supported these opinions, “Bouchard, despite his considerable intellect, is a man of visceral emotions who absorbs defeats personally and broods about them”.

12) Bill Davis

Province: Ontario

Party: Progressive Conservative

Era: 1971-1985

Survey overall legacy average: 4.17

Percentage seats won: 52%

Notable placement: 4th Province Building, 4th Economy Building, 5th Province's Place in Canada, 5th Social Policy

Election record: 2-2-0

Leader Type: Transformational 47%

Out of the so-called “dynasty premiers” in Ontario history, Davis was in office the longest and his reign most impressive because of the economic problems that most of the Western world suffered during his tenure (White 1988). Probably the most overused two-syllable phrase in Canadian political strategy is linked to Davis: “Bland Works” – to list a few allusions to the “bland” approach: 1) “Bill Davis was famously bland: the pipe-smoking personification of 1970s Ontario... a leader who avoided controversy and confrontation above all, and who demonstrated, often successfully, that the best way to achieve consensus was simply to delay” (Ibbitson 2001:103), 2) “(Brampton Bill) was not a charismatic leader who was larger than life and flamboyant. Rather, he was a shy and private individual, a better listener than orator” (Prince 1989:89), and 3) “He is a rather unsophisticated man who is awed by successful cosmopolitan men” (Manthorpe 1974:290). Part of his “bland” approach was to tone down idealism, rely on pragmatism and read the pulse of Ontario through new sophisticated polling carried out by the “Big Blue Machine”. In contrast to other “conservatives” of his era, Davis was generally viewed as a centrist and possibly more important concerning his legacy – a very successful politician.⁴² By the mid-1980s, NDP leader Bob Rae (1996:87) described Davis as doing a “pretty good imitation of Old Man Ontario” but still much personal mystery remained.⁴³ Soon after leaving the premier’s office, Davis immersed himself in the private sector joining nine different boards of major Canadian corporations (Christie 1986).⁴⁴ Many have cited Davis’ non-ideological and camaraderie based rapport to the reason for his minority government’s longevity (Benzie and Ferguson 2006). Jim Coyle (1995:A7) wrote, “Davis knew his essential pragmatism and moderation. In short, he knew himself.” One of Davis’ greatest policy legacies was the creation of the GO Transit providing a public transportation connection between Toronto and the rest of Southern Ontario (Dartsch 2003).

⁴² “Bill Davis was no neo-liberal Margaret Thatcher or Ronald Reagan” – (MacDermid and Albo 2001: 175); “Davis had presided over two majority and two minority governments, had weathered the energy crisis, the constitution crisis, and two recessions, and was considered unbeatable” – (Ibbitson 2001: 114)

⁴³ “Yet hardly anyone knew much about Davis personally, even after he had occupied the Premier’s office for three years” – (Manthorpe 1974: 288)

⁴⁴ A long time Toronto Argonauts fan, Davis was also appointed to head the Canadian Football League board of governors – (Fraser 1986)

11) (tie) Allan Blakeney

Province: Saskatchewan Party: New Democratic Party Era: 1971-1982
Survey overall legacy average: 4.31 Percentage seats won: 52%
Notable placement: 3rd Province Building, 5th Economy Building, 4th Province's Place in
Canada, 1st Social Policy
Election record: 3-0-2 Leader Type: Transformational 60%

During his time as premier in Saskatchewan, Allan Blakeney was often seen as the “epitome of his province” (*Maclean's* 1999:12). He also gained a national reputation as a “pan-Canadian” statesman (Gruending 1990).⁴⁵ Regardless of this gained prominence during constitutional negotiations and playing politics on the national stage, Blakeney was shocked by the 1982 election upset.⁴⁶ Similar to other successful Canadian premiers, Blakeney was also described as “plain to the point of dullness” (Sears 1991:H12). Within his province, Blakeney introduced many social welfare programs; nationally, he played a major role in the 1982 constitution negotiations (*The Toronto Star* 1987a). After his time as premier he served many roles in both political and business circles.⁴⁷ Blakeney, served but later resigned, from the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples in the early-1990s (Platiel 1993).

11) (tie) Clyde Wells

Province: Newfoundland Party: Liberal Era: 1989-1996
Survey overall legacy average: 3.45 Percentage seats won: 63%
Notable placement: None
Election record: 2-0-0 Leader Type: Transformational 34%

The refusal of Clyde Wells to vote for Meech Lake played a major role in shaping his legacy.⁴⁸ Wells anti-Meech stance gained him national attention; “Clyde Wells for Prime Minister” appeared across the country (Bauch 1990). During his opposition to Meech Lake, Wells received more than 40,000 letters, phone calls and faxes from supporters across the country (Gwyn 1995). With Wells’ national exposure, Hubert Bauch (1990:B1) of the *Montreal Gazette* wrote, “He somehow doesn’t fit any mainlander’s notion of a Newfie stereotype. Compared with his predecessors as Newfoundland premier – the outrageously autocratic Joey Smallwood, the hard-partying Frank Moores and the highly excitable Brian Peckford – Wells comes across as a cold and colorless specimen.” Wells left a strong impression with other politicians. Former Progressive Conservative cabinet minister John Crosbie (2003:18) described Wells as “too stubborn, too rigid, too inflexible and not prepared to compromise”. Former Liberal MP George Baker believed, “I have never met in all my years in all my years a politician like Clyde Wells and I never will again. I don’t know how long he’ll survive, but we will never

⁴⁵ Blakeney was approached to take part in the “yes” campaign of the Charlottetown Accord – (Allen 1992)

⁴⁶ “When leaving office, I took the view that I would soon be back. That was not based on statistics, since most governments in Canada last at least two terms” – (Blakeney and Borins 1998:236)

⁴⁷ During the 1990s he was on Algoma Steel’s board and was the head of the Canadian Civil Liberties Association - *Maclean's* “A Message” 1999. Blakeney has been involved in recent federal New Democratic Party federal election committees and also played a role in the strategy around the failed 2008 parliamentary coalition between the Liberals, New Democrats and Bloc Quebecois – (Geddes and Wherry 2008)

⁴⁸ Newfoundland opposition Progressive Conservative leader Lynn Verge noted, “His role in defeating the Meech Lake Accord was certainly a turning point in Canadian history” (Gessell 1995:A2) ; “For better or for worse, Canadians remember Clyde Wells as the man who killed the Meech Lake Accord” – (Paikin 2004:237)

meet him again. There will never be another person as straightforward as Clyde Wells is. That is a fact” (Schachter 1992:1). The Newfoundland’s newspaper *The Northern Pen* praised Clyde Wells for three things: “bringing the woeful finances of Newfoundland more or less under control...dealing with the province’s fragmented, church-run school system and for restoring a sense of virtue to public life” (Sheppard 1996). Clyde Wells was appointed to the Court of Appeal of the Supreme Court of Newfoundland in 1998 and became its Chief Justice in 1999 (Fraser 1999).

9) (tie) Alex Campbell		
Province: Prince Edward Island	Party: Liberal	Era: 1966-1978
Survey overall legacy average: 3.21		Percentage seats won: 68%
Notable placement: 29 th Answer Rate		
Election record: 4-0-0	Leader Type: Transitional	21%

Thomas Axworthy (2003) described Campbell as one of the first premiers to take the environment seriously. Campbell decided to leave after his party’s near-defeat in 1977; for most of his tenure, the premier enjoyed immense popularity (Dorrell 1978). He avoided a possible electoral defeat by taking a position in the Prince Edward Island Superior Court (Milne 2001). In 1984, Campbell was appointed by the Nova Scotia government to study the question of compensation concerning Donald Marshall’s wrongful imprisonment and in 1997 participated on the blue-ribbon panel to select a name for the Prince Edward Island bridge (Barss Donham 1984; *St. Catharines Standard* 1997)

9) (tie) Brian Tobin		
Province: Newfoundland	Party: Liberal	Era: 1996-2000
Survey overall legacy average: 3.00		Percentage seats won: 72%
Notable placement: None		
Election record: 2-0-0	Leader Type: Transactional	43%

Tobin was described as a “master communicator” and a premier who drew comparisons to Newfoundland’s first and most famous premier Joey Smallwood (Cheadle 2002). Tobin was also known as a strong willed leader, “He always appeared most comfortable in a political fight, whether it was the 1995 seizure of a Spanish turbot boat, rallying federalists during the 1995 Quebec referendum, playing hardball with Inco Limited over Labrador nickel development or authorizing illegal federal subsidies to counter Brazil’s illegal support of its aerospace industry in 2001” (Thorne 2002). Tobin’s successor, Roger Grimes, attempted to distance himself from Tobin and the large looming “shadow” he left over Newfoundland with his departure (National Post 2002). While he was away from Ottawa as premier, Tobin remained in close touch with Chretien who accepted him back into the federal scene as the new star candidate (Delacourt 2003).⁴⁹

⁴⁹ Tobin (“Captain” A13) noted in 2003, “I have discovered with much relief that there is life after politics”. – he was correct and very active and in the news - In 2002, he became a vice-chairman of forestry company, Kruger Incorporated (Wyatt 2002). In 2006, it was speculated that Tobin would run for the leadership of the federal Liberal party, he declined noting, “I think I’ve had my opportunity” (*Canadian Press* 2006a) In 2007, Brian Tobin and Ralph Klein came together to supervise development of a continental energy plan sponsored by The Fraser Institute’s Centre for Energy Policy Studies.

7) (tie) Joe Ghiz

Province: Prince Edward Island	Party: Liberal	Era: 1986-1993
Survey overall legacy average: 3.73	Percentage seats won: 64%	
Notable placement: None		
Election Record: 2-0-1	Leader Type: Transformational 30%	

Joe Ghiz left the premier's office only a few years after winning 30 of 32 seats and the Islanders provided the highest majority in supporting the "Yes" side of the Charlottetown Accord (McDougall 1992).⁵⁰ Ghiz was active in writing the Meech Lake Accord and campaigning for the "yes" side of the Charlottetown Accord (*The Globe and Mail* 1996). One of his central legacies will be the push to build a bridge between the Island and New Brunswick (*The Globe and Mail* 1996). In 1995, Ghiz was named to the superior court of Prince Edward Island (*The Globe and Mail* 1995). Ghiz died of colon cancer at the age of 51 in 1996 (Morris 1996).

7) (tie) Ralph Klein

Province: Alberta	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1992-2006
Survey overall legacy average: 2.92	Percentage seats won: 75%	
Notable Placement: 1 st Answer Rate		
Election Record: 4-0-0	Leader Type: Transactional 38%	

By the end of his time as premier of Alberta, Ralph Klein was considered alongside Peter Lougheed, Ernest Manning and Willaim Aberhart as one of the most important premiers of the province – he helped the province's profile both nationally and internationally (Barrie 2004). He was a controversial leader inciting both love and hate. Part of Klein's appeal was his image as an average Albertan.⁵¹ The Klein Revolution was named soon after the 1993 budget which promised to decrease spending by 20 percent (Fekete 2006). Thomas Walkom (2006:A06) wrote, "He (Klein) had no patience for interest groups, except for those made up of his pals. He had less for intellectuals. His Draconian spending cuts in the early '90s caused howls of protest. But Klein calculated the most Albertans – and certainly the province's business class – would back him. And they did." Unfortunately, Klein had a number of embarrassing public moments involving alcohol.⁵² Also, in his final months Klein demonstrated irrational behaviour when hitting an Alberta legislature page with a Liberal health document he dismissed as "crap" (Martin 2006a). Some believe that Klein's legacy will be tarnished by a low leadership review number that expedited his departure from the premier's office (Fekete 2006).⁵³ Shawn Ohler and David Staples (2006:A1) wrote, "Ask Albertans – heck, ask the man himself – what will prove to be Premier Ralph Klein's greatest legacy, and the reply will likely involve the elimination of Alberta's deficit and debt."⁵⁴

⁵⁰ On leaving while on top of the polls, Ghiz noted "They (new leaders) bring in new blood at the top, with new, fresh ideas" – (McDougall 1992)

⁵¹ "People admired and respected Peter Lougheed; he was someone they wanted to be. By contrast, they like Klein and forgive him his excesses because he's so nice and ordinary, just like them" – (Jeffrey 1999:143)

⁵² In 2001, a drunk Klein visited a homeless shelter in downtown Edmonton, berated a homeless man, telling him to get a job and throwing money at him – (Fekete 2006)

⁵³ In a shocking development and crushing setback for Klein, he only received 55.4 percent support from Alberta Progressive Conservative party delegates – (Fekete and Seskus 2006)

⁵⁴ Don Getty did not accept the idea of Klein as "deficit slayer" believing he was simply following the course Getty's government had set – (Ohler and Staples 2006)

5) Brian Peckford

Province: Newfoundland	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1979-1989
Survey overall legacy average: 3.40	Percentage seats won: 72%	
Notable Placement: None		
Election Record: 3-0-0	Leader Type: Transformational 38%	

Thomas Walkom (1989:A7) argued “The Peckford legacy is complex...he was above all a Newfoundland nationalist... (his) critics say his (approach) was too abrasive, too broad-brushed...the most enduring to the Peckford years probably has to do with his obdurate sense of provincial rights.” Peckford’s career was viewed as being “punctuated by confrontation and controversy”, with his most lasting legacy being the Atlantic Accord (Beltrame, “Premier’s” C5). Peckford left some disillusioned with a \$100,000 farewell dinner and \$100,000 severance package (Ward 1989).⁵⁵ The end of his time as premier was sullied due to very unsuccessful policy concerning failed cucumber production.⁵⁶ Peckford’s resignation was sudden with no clear successor in line (Cox 1989). Peckford noted, “I have come to the point in my life after 10 years as leader that I don’t think I have the necessary ruthlessness to do what really has to be done as we move into the next decade” (Cox 1989). *The Toronto Star* (1989:A14) editorial noted, “Peckford has had a checkered record: modest success, unfinished business and a spectacular failure or two”.⁵⁷ Thomas Walkom (1989:A7) wrote, “The Peckford legacy is complex...the most enduring monument to the Peckford years probably has to do with his obdurate sense of provincial rights. He was to Newfoundland what nineteenth-century premier Oliver Mowat was to Ontario – a fierce opponent of central government power”. Unlike other former premiers, Richard Hatfield and John Buchanan, Peckford turned down a Senate seat from Mulroney (Yaffe 1995)

4) Robert Bourassa

Province: Quebec	Party: Liberal	Era: 1970-1976, 1985-1994
Survey overall legacy average: 3.88	Percentage seats won: 68%	
Notable Placement: None		
Election Record: 4-1-0	Leader Type: Transformational 40%	

Bourassa was Quebec’s premier for many of the province’s major historical movements of the last half-century: three rounds of failed constitutional negotiations – the Victoria Charter, Meech Lake Accord, Charlottetown Accord, and the October Crisis and the Oka standoff (Branswell 1996). In Bourassa’s second stint as premier, constitutional concerns between 1987

⁵⁵ Peckford’s successor Tom Rideout tried to distance himself from the previous Progressive Conservative government by using all new staff on his campaign – (Ward 1989)

⁵⁶ “The actual impetus for Peckford’s decline in popularity was the Sprung Greenhouse affair which involved the induction of large sums of provincial money to grow cucumbers hydroponically in Mount Pearl. Crop failures, poor management, and government oversight resulted in the failure of this industrialization project on a magnitude that rivaled Smallwood’s early industrialization schemes in the 1950s” – (Summers 2001:40)

⁵⁷ John Spears (1989:A18) wrote, “Peckford’s admirers say he leaves the province poised on the brink of a secure and wealthy future. His critics shrug that he leaves it with an economy based on the same old fish, forests and minerals, with a new and even more uncertain resource: oil. Nearly everything Peckford has done has been subject to conflicting interpretations, even before he entered political life.”

and 1992 consumed his government’s time and efforts (Bernier 2001). Benoit Aubin (1996:D3) noted, “Bourassa – probably the most vilified and the most abused politician Quebec has known and one of the most durable ones.” Prime Minister Pierre Trudeau called Robert Bourassa “the most hated man in Quebec” (Cernetig 1996). Donn Downey (1996:A14) argued, “for close to a quarter of a century, Robert Bourassa walked a tightrope, balancing the demands of the separatist voices in Quebec against his own vision of a Quebec that could stay in Canada under a revised constitution.” At the time of his death to cancer in 1996, politicians from across the country praised Bourassa: “In my view he was a great Canadian” – David Peterson, “He was genuine, sincere and a first-class human being” – Bill Davis, “Quebec will not forget the history of Robert Bourassa” – Frank McKenna” (Stewart 1996:A28).⁵⁸

3) Roy Romanow

Province: Saskatchewan	Party: New Democratic Party	Era: 1991-2001
Survey overall legacy average: 3.96	Percentage seats won: 70%	
Notable Placement: None		
Election Record: 2-1-0	Leader Type: Transformational 34%	

In the late 1990s, Romanow’s government approval rating was consistently 60 percent or better (Eisler 1997). During his time as premier, Romanow was described as a mainstream and pragmatic politician. Some individuals within the NDP accused him of abandoning the legacy of the party in his effort to fight the provincial deficit (Nemeth and Bergman 1995). Aware of this stigma, Romanow joked after his 1991 election, “You know me, I’m bound to give Saskatchewan people the Liberal government they’ve always wanted” (Eisler 1997:14). Romanow’s difficult policy decisions came from inheriting a \$1-billion deficit from Grant Devine’s government – in an attempt to balance the budget, the Romanow government cut farm insurance plans, closed fifty-two rural hospitals and raised taxes (Wong 2001). After leaving office, Romanow has been repeatedly recruited by both the federal Liberals and New Democrats.⁵⁹ His most recent legacy item, after his career as premier, was leading a royal commission on the future of health care in Canada.

2) Frank McKenna

Province: New Brunswick	Party: Liberal	Era: 1987-1997
Survey overall legacy average: 3.89	Percentage seats won: 87%	
Notable Placement: 2 nd Economy Building		
Election Record: 3-0-0	Leader Type: Transformational 57%	

Stewart Hyson (2005:86) wrote, “If (Richard) Hatfield appeared as being quiet and non-confrontational, and perhaps somewhat hesitant, Frank McKenna was the polar opposite, with his abundant energy level, loquaciousness and willingness to be ‘in-your-face’.” McKenna was dubbed the “Peter Lougheed of the East” and given credit with “rejuvenating and diversifying New Brunswick’s economy and improving the province’s finances and creating jobs” (Sawler

⁵⁸ Some of the Quebec headlines reacting to Bourassa’s death – “Quebec is in mourning” *La Presse*; “The Premier of a whole generation is dead” *Le Devoir* - (*The Globe and Mail* 1996a)

⁵⁹ Romanow was approach during the summer of 2000 by Chretien to run as a federal Liberal candidate, but he declined, staying committed to the New Democratic Party. He was also asked many times to run for the leadership of the New Democratic Party – (Delacourt 2003; Nemeth and Bergman 1995)

2009 ; Livingston 1999).⁶⁰ McKenna was very active during his time as premier recruiting companies to New Brunswick with an environment of limited unions and cheap labour (Ferguson 1997). Since leaving office McKenna's name has been a constant in the Canadian politics rumour mill.⁶¹ Alluding to McKenna's future – Prime Minister Jean Chretien joked, “I know Frank might try to come to take over my job...Frank, there is no rush” (Ferguson 1997). In 2005, McKenna announced he would not seek the Liberal leadership to succeed Paul Martin instead accepting an appointment as the Canadian Ambassador to the United States (Canadian Press 2004a).⁶²

1) Peter Lougheed

Province: Alberta	Party: Progressive Conservative	Era: 1971-1985
Survey overall legacy average: 4.40	Percentage seats won: 73%	
Notable Placement: 5 th Answer Rate, 1 st Province Building, 1 st Economy Building, 1 st Province's Place in Canada		
Election Record: 4-0-1	Leader Type: Transformational 94%	

Alberta political history has been dominated by a small number of strong leaders (Stewart and Archer 2000).⁶³ Possibly the strongest leader was Peter Lougheed. Over twenty years after Lougheed's retirement, *Calgary Herald* columnist Don Braid (2008:5) noted, “Anywhere in modern Alberta, it's almost impossible to glance around without seeing Peter Lougheed's footprints. The former premier's impact is so wide and so deep that he's almost an automatic candidate on the list of candidates for Our Greatest Citizen.” Longtime Canadian political observer and reporter Don Newman argued that Peter Lougheed, “is the standard against which other premiers, both in Alberta and around the country, are measured” (Sawler 2009: 55). Sydney Sharpe (1995:30) described Lougheed as “arguably, one of the most successful and accomplished Canadians of his generation.” Lougheed also played a major role in federal politics, not only being a thorn in Trudeau's side, but also chided Joe Clark over his position on higher energy prices (Simpson 1984).⁶⁴ Former Ontario premier David Peterson once noted, “I looked at all the ex-politicians and said ‘Who do I admire most?’ Peter was my number one example” (Sharpe 1995:30). Alberta historian Frank Dabbs (2008:CC4) described Lougheed in 2008 as Alberta's “greatest public figure” and noted “Lougheed lived his political dream: to take this province from the fringe of Canadian politics to the centre of Canadian life.” When Lougheed left office, Ray Martin, leader of the Alberta New Democratic Party noted on the political impact that, “It's definitely a plus for us. People are walking around here with smiles on

⁶⁰ Philip Lee argued that McKenna changed the way New Brunswick residents thought about themselves and that was “not a small thing” – (Morris 2006b); Dalton Camp (1997) wrote, “Among all the politicians I have known in this country, McKenna seemed to me one of the best and brightest...they don't come much better”

⁶¹ McKenna was approached in 2000 by Chretien to run as a federal candidate in the election – (Delacourt 2003) “Frank McKenna has put together one of the most impressive post-political careers ever seen in Canada” – (Paikin 2004:235)

⁶² McKenna also turned down invitations to run in 2001 for the Liberal leadership – (*Canadian Press* 2001)

⁶³ By 1975, supporters and critics alike called Lougheed “King Peter” – (See Koch 2003)

⁶⁴ Tupper and Doern (1989: 121) noted, “In a sense much more is known about the ‘national Lougheed’ than the ‘provincial Lougheed’”.

their faces.”⁶⁵ Jeffrey Simpson (1985:P6) wrote that “he completely transformed Alberta politics, sweeping away the entrenched Social Credit regime and replacing it with the country’s most solidly entrenched political party.” Many believed he would be a future great prime minister and while being twice pursued to run for the leadership of the federal Progressive Conservative party, Lougheed never accepted the invitation (Palmer and Palmer 1990).

Discussion

There is no politician who does not ponder the legacy they leave behind. Whether or not these thoughts come from within, from advisors, from reporters, from academics or the public - the notion is unavoidable. Politicians may have nuanced views on the concept of legacy but its existence is inescapable. Gary Doer was asked about his legacy and responded, “I often believe the legacy word is not an immediate issue, it’s longer term...some of these issues are a lot longer term than what you’ll be covering tonight and I will be trying to defend tomorrow” (Owen 2009). On the day of his resignation, Mike Harris said, “My legacy is yet to come...I’m far too young for a legacy” (McCarten 2002). According to this paper, Mr. Harris is wrong, no one is too young for a legacy. Premiers as different as Richard Hatfield and Pat Binns and Lucien Bouchard all conjure up feelings and evaluations from those in and out of the political know.

With this approach all of the rankings are highly disputable. Bill Davis at number twelve? John Hamm lower than Grant Devine? Brian Peckford at number five? There are clear limitations to this methodology but the direction of this type of research is wide open. The backgrounds of the survey participants vary greatly considering they are being asked to rank twenty-nine different politicians over forty years and ten provinces based on five categories. The survey design, if this is the appropriate measure, could be the first major challenge. The answer rates were much lower for some premiers – Alex Campbell, P.E.I., 43% – than others – Ralph Klein, Alberta, 94%. It may seem unrealistic to draw any conclusions from this research but that is not the objective of this study. This work is meant to be the start of a discussion and hopefully the start of more research on premiers using a comparative and mixed methods approach.

⁶⁵ Admiration for Lougheed came from different parties and levels of government. On his retirement – “(Lougheed) has done marvelous things for the West and for all of Canada”, Brian Mulroney – “Dominant political force in Western Canada”, John Turner – (*The Globe and Mail* 1985)

References

- Allen, Glen. 1992. "The Big-Picture Planners" *Maclean's*. Vol. 105. No. 38
- Aubin, Benoit. 1996. "Inside Quebec: Bourassa was bridge between Quebec factions" *The Globe and Mail*. 5 October
- Axworthy, Thomas. 2003. "Premiers' Hall of Fame" *National Post*. 28 June
- Barrie, Doreen. 2004. "Ralph Klein, 1992-" *Alberta Premiers of the Twentieth Century*. Ed. Bradford J. Rennie. Regina: University of Regina.
- Barss Donham, Parker. 1984. "The gloves come off over compensation for Marshall" *The Globe and Mail*. 10 March.
- Bauch, Hubert 1990. "King of the Rock: Don't dismiss Clyde Wells he's no Newfie stereotype" *Montreal Gazette*. 16 June
- Beltrame, Julian. 1989. "Premier's splashy exit befits his Bad Boy post" *Montreal Gazette*. 11 March
- Benzie, Robert and Rob Ferguson. 2006. "Taking clues from Davis on minority government" *The Toronto Star*. 28 January
- Bergman, Brian. 1996. "A taint on the Tories" *Maclean's*. Vol. 109 No. 47
- Bernier, Luc. 2001. "Who Governs in Quebec? Revolving Premiers and Reforms" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Bickerton, James. 2001. "Nova Scotia: The Political Economy of Regime Change" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Blakeney, Allan and Sanford Borins. 1998. *Political Management in Canada*. Second Edition. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Blanchfield, Mike, Sheldon Alberts and Mia Rabson. 2009. "Doer going to Washington" *Edmonton Journal*. 29 August
- Bliss, Michael. 2004. *Right Honourable Men: The Descent of Canadian Politics from Macdonald to Chretien*. Toronto: HarperCollinsPublishers Limited.
- Braid, Don. 1985. "Lougheed's move weakens western influence" *Edmonton Journal*. 16 November.

- . 2008. "Premier for the people: Thirty-seven years after he first swept to power as premier, Peter Lougheed is still considered one of the best leaders this province has ever seen" *Calgary Herald*. 14 September.
- Branswell, Jack. 1996. "Bourassa admirers bid final farewell" *The Toronto Star*. 6 October
- Brennan, Richard. 2002. "Walking in Davis's footsteps" *The Hamilton Spectator*. 19 September
- Brewster, Murray. 2006. "Harper, Cellucci bid farewell to Hamm as N.S. Tories pick new leader" *Canadian Press*. 10 February
- . 2006a. "Retiring premier praised as 'honest, decent'" *St. Catharines Standard*. 11 February
- Brown, Curtis. "Doer dynasty or aberration?" *Winnipeg Free Press*. 16 October
- Brownsey, Keith. 2001. "The Post-Institutionalized Cabinet: The Administrative Style of Alberta" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Brownsey, Keith and Michael Howlett. 2001. "Introduction: The Provincial State in Canada" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Toronto: Broadview Press.
- Burney, Derek H. 2005. *Getting It Done: A Memoir*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Camp, Dalton. 1997. "McKenna one of the brightest" *The Toronto Star*. 8 October
- Canadian Press*. 2006. "Brian Tobin becomes third high-profile Liberal to snub leadership" 31 January
- . 2001. "Former N.B. premier McKenna says he's not interested in federal leadership" 4 October
- . 2006a. "Former Nova Scotia premier John Buchanan retires from Senate at 75" 21 April
- . 2005. "Former Saskatchewan premier Devine hopes portrait captures 'pioneering spirit'" 22 February.
- . 2004. "Former N.B. premier McKenna says he won't run in federal election" 19 March
- . 2005a. "N.S. premier save woman's life after collapse at fundraiser" 22 September.
- CBC News*. 2005. "N.S. Premier Hamm announces retirement" 29 September.
- Cernetig, Miro. 1992a. "Getty just couldn't avoid the sack" *The Globe and Mail*. 17 September.

- . 1992b. "Getty's Last Down?" *The Globe and Mail*. 15 February.
- . 1992c. "Lougheed shadow dogging Getty Ex-premier's rebuke damaging" *The Globe and Mail*. 30 January
- . 1996. "Western Voices: How Western Canada remembers Robert Bourassa" *The Globe and Mail*. 4 October
- Cheadle, Bruce. 2002. "Brian Tobin leaves politics the way he entered and practiced" *The Canadian Press*. 14 January
- Christie, Alan. 1986. "Bill Davis: Finally some time for fun" *The Toronto Star*. 22 March
- Cormier, Michel and Achille Michaud. 1991. *Richard Hatfield: Power and Disobedience*. Fredricton: Goose Lane.
- Cox, Kevin. 1990. "Buchanan departure marked by evasion" *The Globe and Mail*. 14 September
- . 1989. "Peckford quitting stuns Tories" *The Globe and Mail*. 23 January
- . 1998. "What the Regan jury didn't hear" *The Globe and Mail*. 18 December
- Coyle, Jim. 1995. "Bill Davis had what it took to be premier" *Kitchener-Waterloo Record*. 20 April
- Crosbie, John. 2003. "Untitled" *Guardians on Trial*. Ed. Anthony Hall. Toronto: Dundurn Press.
- Dabbs, Frank. 2008. "Straight shooter at political high noon" *Calgary Herald*. 31 August
- Dartsch, Raymond. 2003. "Davis's demeanour bred success" *The Hamilton Spectator*. 9 April
- Delacourt, Susan. 2003. *Juggernaut: Paul Martin's campaign for Chretien's crown*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart.
- Desbarats, Peter. 1977. *Rene: A Canadian in Search of a Country*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart-Bantam Limited.
- Dorrell, Martin. 1978. "Grits gather in caucus for ho-hum leader race" *The Globe and Mail*. 9 December
- Dorrell, Martin. 1978b. "Grits gather in caucus for ho-hum leader race" *The Globe and Mail*. 9 December
- Downey, Donn. 1996. "Robert Bourassa 1933-1996" *The Globe and Mail*. 3 October

- Eisler, Dale. 1997. "Romanow's Reign" *Maclean's* Vol. 110 No. 48
- Fekete, Jason. 2006. "The remarkable, historic reign of King Klein" *Calgary Herald*. 5 April
- Fekete, Jason and Tony Seskus. 2006. "Tories desert Klein" *Calgary Herald*. 1 April
- Ferguson, Derek. 1997. "What's next for McKenna?" *The Toronto Star*. 13 October
- Ferguson, Jonathan. 1991. "Colourful Hatfield believed in Canada" *The Toronto Star*. 27 April
A6
- Ferguson, Will. 1999. *Bastards and Boneheads: Canada's Glorious Leaders Past and Present*.
Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre.
- Fotheringham, Allan. 1989. "Ed Schreyer's life still not one of retirement" *Financial Post*. 14
December.
- Fraser, Graham. 1990. "Buchanan resigns to enter Senate" *The Globe and Mail*. 13 September
- . 1985. "Levesque bows out" *The Globe and Mail*. 21 June
- . 2001. *Rene Levesque and the Parti Quebecois in power*. Montreal: McGill
Queen's University Press.
- . 1999. "Wells top judge in Newfoundland" *The Globe and Mail*. 12 January
- Fraser, Rick. "Ex-premier Davis to head CFL board" *The Toronto Star*. 29 November
- Garr, Allen. 1985. *Tough Guy: Bill Bennett and the taking of British Columbia*. Toronto: Key
Porter Books.
- Geddes, John and Aaron Wherry. 2008. "Inside a Crisis that Shook the Nation" *Maclean's* Vol.
121. No. 51
- Gessell, Paul. 1995. "Wells remembered most for his stand on Meech" *Ottawa Citizen*. 29
December
- Gibson, Ann and Patricia Lush. 1996. "Bennett guilty of insider trading – Former British
Columbia premier, brother, Doman chairman placed under 10-year ban" *The Globe and
Mail*. 30 August. A1
- Girard, Daniel. 1999. "Doer vows to shun old NDP ways – I'm not Howard Pawley" *The
Toronto Star*. 23 September
- . 1999a. "Four in a row for Filmon?" *The Toronto Star*. 21 September.

Glenn, Ted. 2001. "Politics, Personality, and History in Ontario's Administrative Style" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.

The Globe and Mail. 2007. "and Binns's new job" 31 August

---. 1987. "Mr. Blakeney's plans" 11 August

---. 1999. "Filmon's odds" 17 September

---. 1995. "Justice Ghiz named to top PEI court" 6 April

---. 1985. "Lougheed praised, foes relieved" 27 June

---. 1995. "The legacy of Clyde Wells" 29 December

---. 1996. "Obituary – Joe Ghiz Former premier helped draft constitutional accords" 1 November

---. 1996a. "Quebecois Voices: Views from the media" 4 October

---. 1987a. "Rene Levesque: 1922-1987" 3 November

---. 1988. "Replacing Premier Pawley" 8 April

---. 1988a. "Vote on budget defeats Pawley in Manitoba" 9 March

Gordon, Sean. 2006. "No way he'll ever return to politics, Bouchard says" *The Toronto Star*. 13 May

Gruending, Dennis. 1990. *Promises to Keep: A Political Biography of Allan Blakeney*. Saskatoon: Western Producer Prairies Books.

The Guardian. 2007. "P.E.I.'s Binns buried in rival's landslide" 29 May

Gwyn, Richard. 1995. "Stubborn Wells blazed trail for politics of conviction" *The Toronto Star*. 31 December

Hamilton, Graeme. 1998. "The twilight of Gerald Regan's career was not to be set in a courtroom" *National Post*. 17 November

Hyson, Stewart. 2005. "Governing from the Centre in New Brunswick" *Executive Styles in Canada: Cabinet Structures and Leadership Practices in Canadian Government*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Ibbitson, John. 2001. *Loyal No More: Ontario's Struggle for a Separate Destiny*. Toronto:

HarperCollins.

Jeffrey, Brooke. 1999. *Hard Right Turn: The New Face of Neo-Conservatism in Canada*. Toronto: HarperCollins Publishers Limited.

Killick, Adam. 2000. "Filmon retiring from public service" *National Post*. 25 May

Kitchener-Waterloo Record. 2002. "Eves finishes year with Harris hangover" 26 December

---. 2002a. "Nova Scotia drops sex charges against ex-premier Regan" 18 April

---. 1991. "Richard Hatfield served 17 years as New Brunswick premier" 26 April

Koch, George. 2003. "Lougheed taps the oil patch to build amight province" *Alberta in the 20th Century: A Journalistic History of the Province. Vol. 11. Lougheed and the War with Ottawa, 1971-1984*. Edmonton: History Book Publications Limited.

Lett, Dan. 2009. "One in a million – Doer's combination of winning attributes made him a unique success" *Winnipeg Free Press*. 17 October

Leslie, Keith. 2007. "Former premier Harris joined by Davis, Eves, Peterson for portrait unveiling" *The Canadian Press*. 26 January

Lewandowski, John. 2006. "Former N.S. premier Hamm denies influencing \$350,000 loan to friend" *Canadian Press*. 29 March

Lisac, Mark. 2004. "Don Getty, 1985-1992" *Alberta Premiers of the Twentieth Century*. Ed. Bradford J. Rennie. Regina: University of Regina.

---. 1992. "Don Getty got what he wanted and then left" *The Hamilton Spectator*. 11 September

Lisee, Jean-Francois. 2001. "A leader like no other, a man of compassion" *The Toronto Star*. 13 January

Livingston, Gillian. 1999. "Busy McKenna misses 'passion'" *The Toronto Star*. 16 September

Lownsbrough, John. 1993. "Found: A Canadian character – Richard Hatfield" *The Globe and Mail*. 30 January

Macafee, Michelle. 2001. "Bouchard leaves Quebec politics with economic success and unrealized dream" *The Canadian Press*. 1 March

MacDermid, Robert and Greg Albo. 2001. "Divided Province, Growing Protests: Ontario Moves Right" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.

- Maclean's*. 1999. "A Message to the World". Vol. 112 No. 15
- . 2004. "Passages" Vol. 117 No.9
- Mallan, Caroline. 2002. "Harris regrets he didn't act faster" *The Toronto Star*. 6 March
- Manthorpe, Jonathan. 1974. *The Power and the Tories: Ontario Politics – 1943 to the present*. Toronto: Macmillan of Canada.
- Martin, Don. 2006a. "Nobody likes a cranky Ralph Klein" *National Post*. 4 March
- Martin, Lawrence. 1997. *The Antagonist: Lucien Bouchard and the Politics of Delusion*. Toronto: Viking.
- Mason Lee, Robert. 1989. *One Hundred Monkeys: The Triumph of Popular Wisdom in Canadian Politics*. Toronto: MacFarlane, Walter and Ross.
- McCarten, James. 2002. "Love or hate Harris, Ontario won't soon forget its tenacious former premier" *The Canadian Press*. 14 March
- McDougall, Tom. 1992. "Ghiz quits while he is still on top" *Canadian Press*. 3 November
- McGregor, Greg. 2005. "Past views could haunt Schreyer" *Ottawa Citizen*. 16 December
- Montreal Gazette*. 1988. "Pawley quits as Manitoba faces election" 10 March
- Morris, Chris. 2007. "Liberals end 11-year reign by Tories" *The Toronto Star*. 29 May
- Mellon, Hugh. 2001. "The Challenge of the New Brunswick Politics" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Milne, David A. 2001. "Prince Edward Island: Politics in a Beleaguered Garden" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Morris, Chris. 2006. "Career of former New Brunswick premier illustrates ups and downs of political life" *Canadian Press*. 13 December
- . 2006a. "Former boy wonder fights for political life" *Edmonton Journal*. 5 September
- . 2007. "Harper appoints Bernard Lord to review government language policies" *Canadian Press*. 3 December
- . 2006b. "McKenna uses impeccable timing to once again bow out of public life" *Canadian Press*. 30 January

- . 1996. "Mourners praise Ghiz as believer in Canada" *The Toronto Star*. 14 November
- . 2006c. "Once bright political star Premier Bernard Lord loses New Brunswick election" *Canadian Press*. 18 September
- Moore, Dene. 2005. "Frank Moores was Newfoundland's first Tory premier" *The Toronto Star*. 11 July
- Nairne, Douglas. 1999. "Filmon leaves the Tory helm" *Winnipeg Free Press*. 22 September
- National Post*. 2002. "Grimes applauds departure of Brian Tobin: Takes shot at predecessor" 18 January
- Nemeth, Mary. 1995. "Bucking the trend" *Maclean's* Vol. 108 No. 27
- Nemeth, Mary and Brian Bergman. 1995. "The middle way" *Maclean's* Vol. 108 No. 24
- Netherton, Alex. 2001. "Paradigm and Shift: A Sketch of Manitoba Politics" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Newman, Peter C. 2005. *The Secret Mulroney Tapes: Unguarded Confessions of a Prime Minister*. Toronto: Random House, 2005.
- Nolan, Dan. 2002. "Tories say goodbye to Harris" *The Hamilton Spectator*. 22 March
- Oake, George. 1992. "Don Getty finally breaks free from party that wanted him out" *The Toronto Star*. 10 September
- Ohler, Shawn and David Staples. 2006. "Klein's Legacy" *Edmonton Journal*. 9 April
- The Ottawa Citizen*. 1988. "In Manitoba, it's eyes-right once again" 11 March
- Owen, Bruce. 2009. "Doer decade about to end" *Winnipeg Free Press*. 28 August
- Paikin, Steve. *The Dark Side: The Personal Price of a Political Life*. Toronto: Penguin Canada, 2004.
- Palmer, Howard and Tamara Palmer. *Alberta: A New History*. 1990. Edmonton: Hurtig Publishers.
- Panetta, Alexander. 2001. "Bouchard confirms he will quit as Quebec after failing on sovereignty" *Canadian Press*. 11 January
- Platiel, Rudy. 1993. "Blakeney says start on solutions needed" *The Globe and Mail*. 6 April

- Prince, Michael J. 1989. "The Bland Stops Here: Ontario Budgeting in the Davis Era, 1971-1985" *Budgeting in the Provinces: Leadership and the Premiers*. Toronto: Institute of Public Administration of Canada.
- Rabson, Mia. 2005. "Filmon portrait unveiling sparks emotional tributes" *Winnipeg Free Press*. 30 April
- Rae, Bob. 1996. *From Protest to Power: Personal Reflections on a Life in Politics*. Toronto: Viking Group.
- Rasmussen, Ken. 2001. "Saskatchewan: From Entrepreneurial State to Embedded State" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Richer, Shawna. 2005. "Frank Moores, Newfoundland Premier" *The Globe and Mail*. 11 July
- Roberts, David. 1992. "Devine steps down as Tory leader" *The Globe and Mail*. 9 October
- Samyn, Paul. 2005. "Filmon named Canada's top spy-watcher" *Winnipeg Free Press*. 25 June.
- Samyn, Paul. 2005a. "Schreyer recruited as star for NDP" *Winnipeg Free Press*. 15 December
- Sawatsky, John. 1987. *The Insiders: Government, Business and the Lobbyists*. Toronto; McClelland and Stewart.
- Sawler, Harvey. 2009. *Frank McKenna: Beyond Politics*. Vancouver: Douglas and MacIntyre.
- Schachter, Harvey. "Feisty Clyde Wells's strengths also his weaknesses" *Kingston Whig Standard*. 16 December 1992.
- Schreiner, John. 1991. "Don't bet on Devine rule ending yet" *Financial Post*. 23 September
- Schuettler, Darren. 1992. "Getty to quit after 7 years as premier" *The Financial Post*. 10 September
- Sears, Val. 1991. "Allan Blakeney: The life of a good, gray man" *The Toronto Star*. 9 March
- Sharpe, Sydney. 1995. "Lougheed at Large" *The Financial Post*. 1 February
- Sheppard, Robert. 1996. "The mantle worn by Clyde Wells" *The Globe and Mail*. 25 January
- Simpson, Jeffrey. 1984. *Discipline of Power: The Conservative Interlude and the Liberal Restoration*. Toronto: Macmillan of Canada, 1984.
- . 1985. "The Lougheed imprint" 27 June

- . 1993. *Faultlines: Struggling for a Canadian Vision*. Toronto: HarperCollins.
- Singer, Zev. 2005. "Newfoundland's second premier" *National Post*. 12 July
- Smith, Dan. 1986. "A dynasty ends as Bennett bows out" *The Toronto Star*. 23 May
- Smith, Dan and Harper, Tim. 1986. "Bill Bennett shocks British Columbia by announcing he will quit as Premier" *The Toronto Star*. 23 May
- Spears, John. 1991. "Buchanan cleared in kickbacks case after 'vicious year' *The Toronto Year*. 17 September
- . 1989. "Two portraits of Peckford" *The Toronto Star*. 22 January
- St. Catharines Standard*. 1997. "Ottawa rejected first name for bridge" 6 January.
- Stewart, David and Keith Archer. 2000. *Quasi-Democracy? Parties and Leadership Selection in Alberta*. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Stewart, Edison. 1996. "Politicians pay tribute to 'great man' Bourassa" *The Toronto Star*. 3 October
- Story, Alan. 1987. "Hatfield rattled as questions turn to past problems" *Toronto Star*. 7 April. A3
- Story, Alan. 1987b. "Richard Hatfield was to New Brunswick what Joey Smallwood was to Newfoundland and Maurice Duplessis was to Quebec" *The Toronto Star*. 14 October
- Summers, Valerie A. 2001. "Between a Rock and a Hard Place: Regime Change in Newfoundland" *The Provincial State in Canada: Politics in the Provinces and Territories*. Eds. Keith Brownsey and Michael Howlett. Toronto: Broadview Press.
- Taber, Jane. 2009. "Doer to step down as Manitoba Premier" *The Globe and Mail*. 28 August
- Thorne, Stephen. 2002. "Brian Tobin has no plans to return to politics" *The Canadian Press*. 23 August
- The Toronto Star*. 1989. "Peckford bows out" 24 January
- . 1992. "RCMP clears Buchanan after probe of trust fund" 18 January 1992.
- . 1987. "Saskatchewan NDP convention set to replace retiring leader Blakeney" 9 August
- Toughill, Kelly. 1998. "Not guilty" *The Toronto Star*. 19 December
- Tupper, Allan and Bruce Doern. 1989. "Alberta Budgeting in the Lougheed Era" Budgeting in

the Provinces: Leadership and the Premiers. Toronto: Institute of Public Administration of Canada.

- Walkom, Thomas. 2006. "Decoding the Klein vote" *The Toronto Star*. 2 April
- . Thomas. 1989. "Putting Peckford in perspective" *The Globe and Mail*. 14 March
- . 1983. "Schreyer leaves record of gaffes and informality" *The Globe and Mail*. 24 December
- Walsh, Bren. 1979. "Premiership race is on to fill Moores vacuum" *The Globe and Mail*. 27 January
- Ward, Doug. 2006. "Bill Bennett tells his fairy tale" *Vancouver Sun*. 3 May
- Ward, Stephen. 1989. "Newfoundland Tories eye their wounded leader" *Montreal Gazette*. 28 April
- Wattie, Chris. 2001. "Bouchard to resign today" *National Post*. 11 January
- White, Randall. 1998. *Ontario Since 1985*. Toronto: EastendBooks.
- Winnipeg Free Press. 2005. "Blunt, forceful memoir of Schreyer years" 13 November
- Wiseman, Nelson. 2001. "The Pattern of Prairie Politics" *Party Politics in Canada*. Eds. Hugh G. Thorburn and Alan Whitehorn. Toronto: Prentice-Hall.
- Wong, Craig. 2001. "Reality of departure sinks in for outgoing Saskatchewan Premier Roy Romanow" *Canadian Press*. 27 January
- Wyatt, Nelson. 2002. "Former industry minister appointed vice-chairman of Kruger Inc" *The Canadian Press*. 14 February
- Yaffe, Barbara. 1995. "Newfie bad boy premier has switched coasts" *The Hamilton Spectator*. 22 April
- York, Geoffrey. 1989. "Manitoba MLAs want Schreyer to run for federal NDP leadership" *The Globe and Mail*. 18 May
- . 1988a. "Pawley to stay until Manitoba election" *The Globe and Mail*. 1 April
- . 1988a. "Voters in Manitoba pass judgement today on Pawley resignation" 26 April.